

Attachment A to Agenda File No. 2024-290

**ADDENDUM**

FINAL MITIGATED NEGATIVE DECLARATION

(SCH #2009111064)

**B STREET SHORE POWER PROJECT**



**September 2024**

**San Diego Unified Port District  
3165 Pacific Highway  
San Diego, California 92101**

## ADDENDUM

to

### FINAL MITIGATED NEGATIVE DECLARATION B STREET SHORE POWER PROJECT

(SCH #2009111064)

for

### ADDITIONAL SOUTH BERTH SHORE POWER CONNECTION POINT AT B STREET CRUISE SHIP TERMINAL PROJECT

## 1.0 INTRODUCTION

### **PREVIOUS PROJECT AND ADOPTED MND**

The Final Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) for the B Street Shore Power Project (previous Project) was adopted by the Board of Port Commissioners (Board) on January 5, 2010, by Resolution No. 2010-07, Clerk Document No. 69487. At that time, the Board also authorized issuance of a Non-Appealable Coastal Development Permit (CDP) No. 2010-001, by Resolution No. 2010-08. The MND addressed the proposed modifications necessary to install shore power equipment at B Street Pier and Broadway Pier Cruise Ship Terminals (CST) so that cruise ships berthing at B Street Pier or Broadway Pier can use electrical power from the shore rather than their own engines while at berth. The Project allowed for three berths to be equipped with shore power equipment (north and south of B Street Pier and north of Broadway Pier). Power was to be provided in two phases. Phase 1 of the Project provided shore power to one cruise ship at a time for ships berthed at either B Street Pier or at Broadway Pier. Phase 2 of the Project provided shore power simultaneously to two cruise ships, regardless of which of the three berths the ships are docked. The MND identified three cruise ships that typically docked at B Street Pier and Broadway Pier CSTs which were shore power capable - the Dawn Princess, Oosterdam, and Westerdam. Based on the number of visits by these three ships, the previous Project anticipated that there would be approximately 51 vessel visits per year that would connect to shore power compared to a total of approximately 257 vessel visits per year by 33 different cruise ships. The previous Project considered a shore power capable ship as a vessel that contains on-board systems and connections that can be connected to dock-side power systems. As additional ships become shore power capable, the previous Project allowed for capable ships to use shore power and further reduce emissions.

The previous Project, as analyzed and constructed, generally consists of the following improvements on B Street Pier, Broadway Pier, as well as off the piers:

#### ***B Street Pier***

There are two existing berths at B Street Pier, commonly referred to as the northern and southern berths. The previous Project allowed for shore power capable cruise ships to obtain power from the shore through flexible electrical cables, which were provided and installed by San Diego Gas &

Electric (SDG&E). In general, the B Street CST Shore Power System included shore power electrical equipment, automation and operational software infrastructure at B Street Pier including meters, breakers, relays, two ground switches (one for each berth), capacitors, transformers, control panels, cables, cable conduits, approximately 12-foot-tall jib cranes for cable management and support, concrete mounting pads, fencing, and other ancillary improvements.

### ***Broadway Pier***

Several modifications at Broadway Pier were made to allow for cruise ships to connect to shore power. In general, improvements at Broadway Pier were limited to minor cable and equipment installation to connect to the SDG&E Station B Substation and electrical infrastructure located at the eastern end of B Street Pier. One ground switch and a power cable winch were installed on the north berth of Broadway Pier to connect to electrical conduits and cables running through the existing CST Building. The Project also included a 12-foot-tall jib crane on Broadway Pier for cable management. Cruise ship calls are limited to the northern berth on Broadway Pier.

### ***Electrical Improvements***

The cables transmitting electricity between the piers are located in conduits hanging from the underside of the wharf along Harbor Drive. The cables installed by SDG&E are located in buried conduits running along Broadway Street and continuing along Harbor Drive. All electrical cables and conduits are connected to the electrical infrastructure located at the eastern end of B Street Pier which connects to the SDG&E Station B Substation, which is located west of Kettner Boulevard and southeast of E Street. The primary electrical equipment necessary to connect a cruise ship to shore power, including the transformers and related equipment, required an approximately 2,100 square foot equipment pad area to serve one ship at any time at any of the three berths (Phase 1). The electrical equipment required to serve two ships at a time at any of the three berths increased the equipment pad area to approximately 3,600 square feet (Phase 2). A safety perimeter barrier was constructed around the electrical equipment, located between the existing security fence and main distribution equipment area, as mitigation to potentially significant noise impacts identified during the analysis of the previous Project.

Following approval of the previous Project by the Board, construction of Phase 1 commenced and was partially completed in 2011, since no improvements were made at Broadway Pier. Phase 2 of the previous Project commenced in 2021 and was completed in 2022 which brought the District into compliance with the 2020 CARB At-Berth Regulation, requiring all shore power capable cruise ships calling to San Diego to use shore power while at berth as of January 1, 2023.

### **CURRENT PROPOSED PROJECT**

The District, as the Project Proponent and Lead Agency pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 21067, proposes to install an alternative shore power connection point on the eastern end of the southern berth of the B Street Pier CST (Additional South Berth Shore Power Connection Point at B Street Cruise Ship Terminal Project [proposed Project]). The proposed Project will enable vessels with starboard connections to access shore power at the southern berth's eastern end. The current shore power infrastructure at B Street Pier and Broadway Pier only allows for vessels with a portside connection to utilize shore power while docked at the south berth at B Street Pier. Since completion of Phase 2 of the previous Project, it was noted that additional flexibility was needed to accommodate two cruise ships with starboard connectivity simultaneously.

To enhance the existing shore power infrastructure to allow vessels with starboard connections to access shore power at the southern berth at B Street Pier CST, the proposed Project would consist of the following improvements:

#### **Installation of Shore Power Equipment:**

- Installation of one (1) shore power ground switch.

- Installation of approximately 80 linear feet of under-deck conduit.
- Installation of saw-tooth shore power outlet assembly.
- Construction activities include procurement of materials, wire pulling and terminating conductors, securing equipment to the pier deck, testing, programming, and commissioning new equipment with the existing shore power system.

#### Conductor Placement:

- Use of reels and mechanized pulling for conductor placement within the existing conduit duct bank and new under-deck conduit channel.
- Pull conductors through the previously constructed duct bank along the south berth (approximately 750 linear feet).
- Implementation of Best Management Practices (BMPs) for below deck work to ensure materials and equipment do not enter the San Diego Bay.

#### Laydown Area

- Designate an approximately 50 feet by 50 feet laydown area.
- Implementation of BMPs for perimeter controls.

Construction of the proposed Project is anticipated to begin in approximately Fall 2024 and occur over the course of four months.

The proposed Project will not result in an increase in capacity and would not enable more than two ships to be connected to shore power, as originally analyzed by the adopted MND. The alternative starboard connection at the southern berth at B Street Pier CST allows for flexibility when cruise ships with varying infrastructure call to San Diego.

### **DETERMINATION TO PREPARE AN ADDENDUM**

Section 15162 of the State CEQA Guidelines states the following:

- (a) When an EIR has been certified or a negative declaration adopted for a project, no subsequent EIR shall be prepared for that project unless the lead agency determines, on the basis of substantial evidence in the light of the whole record, one or more of the following:
- 1) Substantial changes are proposed in the project which will require major revisions of the previous EIR or negative declaration due to the involvement of new significant environmental effects or a substantial increase in the severity of previously identified significant effects;

Discussion: The proposed Project does not require major revisions to the adopted MND, because there are no substantial changes that would involve new or more severe significant environmental effects. The previous Project analyzed the construction of the initial shore power systems and electrical infrastructure at B Street and Broadway Pier CST. The previous Project, as analyzed and constructed, allowed for three berths to be equipped with shore power equipment (north and south of B Street Pier and north of Broadway Pier). However, only two berths can provide shore power concurrently, because the south berth at B Street CST and north berth at Broadway CST are connected to the same electrical substation. Following construction of the previous Project, it was noted that additional flexibility was needed to accommodate two cruise ships with starboard connectivity concurrently at B Street CST. The proposed Project would involve installation of a starboard

connection point on the eastern end of the south berth at B Street Pier CST and would enhance the existing shore power infrastructure by creating flexibility for cruise ships with either starboard or portside connections to connect to shore power at this location. Minor electrical improvements will be required to connect the alternative starboard connection to the existing SDG&E substation, but new conduit and cable will be pulled through previously constructed duct banks. Currently, cruise ships are limited to the north berth at B Street Pier CST or Broadway for starboard connections or the south berth at B Street CST for a portside connection. The alternative starboard connection to be installed at B Street CST would resolve scheduling conflicts between cruise ships by providing an additional option for which berth they can plug into for shore power and would minimize the number of CARB At-Berth Regulation exemptions used in case a vessel is unable to connect to shore power while at berth. Similar to the previous Project, there would be no increase in capacity as a result of the proposed Project. Therefore, there are no substantial changes from the proposed Project that would involve new or more severe significant environmental effects than what was previously analyzed.

- 2) Substantial changes occur with respect to the circumstances under which the project is undertaken which will require major revisions of the previous EIR or Negative Declaration due to the involvement of new significant environmental effects or a substantial increase in the severity of previously identified significant effects; or

Discussion: No substantial changes in the circumstances of undertaking the Project have been identified during the preparation of this Addendum. The MND identifies several commercial establishments north of the project site, including Anthony's Fish Grotto which was redeveloped to become Portside Pier in 2020. Otherwise, the environmental setting remains the same as what was previously analyzed in the MND.

The adopted MND identified noise impacts as less than significant with mitigation incorporated. The MND utilized the City of San Diego CEQA Significance Determination Thresholds established in 2007 to determine that there would be a potentially significant impact from the operational noise of the two (2) transformers that were installed at the B Street Pier CST as part of Phase 1 and Phase 2 of the previous Project. To mitigate for the noise omitted from the transformers during operation, a noise barrier was constructed along the eastern fence line adjacent to the transformer. The adopted MND indicates that potential impacts on aesthetics have already been analyzed, and no effects would occur beyond those analyzed. The alternative starboard connection would not require installation of an additional transformer, and the noise barrier, as constructed, continues to address any concerns regarding noise from operations. There will not be core drilling on the deck during construction of the proposed Project. Construction related noise will be temporary, and all construction activities will be conducted in accordance with the City of San Diego Noise Ordinance (San Diego Municipal Code, Section 59.5.01), which limits loud construction noises to the hours of 7 a.m. to 7 p.m., Monday through Saturday, as analyzed in the adopted MND. Therefore, the noise analysis previously conducted in the adopted MND remains the same, and there would be no change in circumstances resulting in new significant environmental effects or a substantial increase in the severity of previously identified significant effects.

All new electrical equipment required for the proposed Project would connect to existing electrical infrastructure located on the eastern end of B Street Pier, which connects to the SDG&E Substation B located west of Kettner Boulevard and southeast of E Street. No additional transformers would be required to power the additional starboard connection point, and the maximum number of cruise ships able to connect to shore power would still

be limited to two vessels.

It was previously assumed that there would be approximately 51 vessel visits per year that would connect to shore power compared to a total of approximately 257 vessel visits per year by 33 different cruise ships. In 2022, it was estimated that B Street CST receives approximately 90-100 vessel calls annually; whereas Broadway CST receives approximately 12-14 vessel calls annually<sup>1</sup>. On average, the demand for cruise ships calling into San Diego has decreased since adoption of the 2010 MND. The approximately 257 vessel visits per year previously estimated in 2010 is now closer to a total of approximately 114 vessel visits per year as of 2022. Although the proposed Project would add an alternative starboard connection point at B Street CST, there would not be an increase in capacity of vessels to connect to shore power at B Street and Broadway CST, and the updated average number of vessel trips per year does not exceed the number of calls previously analyzed.

- 3) New information of substantial importance, which was not known and could not have been known with the exercise of reasonable diligence at the time the previous EIR was certified as complete or the Negative Declaration was adopted, shows any of the following:
- (A) The project will have one or more significant effects not discussed in the previous EIR or negative declaration,
  - (B) Significant effects previously examined will be substantially more severe than shown in the previous EIR;
  - (C) Mitigation measures or alternatives previously found not to be feasible would in fact be feasible, and would substantially reduce one or more significant effects of the project, but the project proponents decline to adopt the mitigation measure or alternative; or
  - (D) Mitigation measures or alternatives which are considerably different from those analyzed in the previous EIR would substantially reduce one or more significant effects on the environment, but the project proponents decline to adopt the mitigation measure or alternative.

Discussion: There is some new information, which was not known and could not have been known with the exercise of reasonable due diligence at the time the 2010 MND was adopted. Specifically, since adoption of the 2010 MND, there have been several updates to State regulations and District policies as detailed below. For the reasons described herein, this new information does not show any new or more severe environmental impacts or identify any substantially different feasible mitigation measures than were previously identified and adopted in the MND.

In December 2007, CARB adopted the At-Berth Regulation, also known as the Shore Side Power Rule, to reduce diesel particulate emissions from ships while docked at berth by January 1, 2014. The CARB At-Berth Regulation mandated that shore power infrastructure at District facilities must be operational and able to accommodate 50% of all cruise ship

---

<sup>1</sup> The following information on annual vessel calls was reported as part of the CARB Terminal and Port Plans. The requirements for a terminal and port plan are found in Section 93130.14(a) and 93130.14(b) of the At-Berth Regulation. Terminal and Port Plans for the B Street and Broadway CST were deemed complete by CARB on December 29, 2022.

calls in 2014 and escalated to 80% of all cruise ship calls by 2020. Implementation of the previous Project was a necessary step for eventual compliance with the 2007 CARB At-Berth Regulation. Since construction of Phase 1 of the previous Project was completed in 2011 and Phase 2 completed in 2022, the previous Project complied with the CARB At-Berth Regulation.

As a result of the revised 2020 CARB's At-Berth Regulation, shore power regulations became more stringent mandating that all cruise ships calling into San Diego would need to connect to shore power by January 1, 2023, with several exceptions. The 2020 At-Berth Regulation supersedes the 2007 At-Berth Regulation which remained relevant until December 31, 2022. The Project continues to comply with the updated 2020 CARB At-Berth Regulation, because Phase 2 of the Project completed the electrical infrastructure improvements in 2022 necessary for two cruise ships to connect to shore power simultaneously, with one ship connected at the northern berth at B Street CST and the other ship connected at either the southern berth at B Street CST or the northern berth at Broadway CST. The southern berth at B Street CST and the northern berth at Broadway CST are connected to the same electrical substation, and therefore, two ships cannot connect to shore power at those berths simultaneously.

Current and future District operations at the B Street and Broadway Pier CST allow for a maximum of two cruise ships to be connected to shore power simultaneously. Based on previous and current District operations, it is rare that three cruise ships would call to San Diego and require concurrent shore power connections. For the upcoming 2024/2025 cruise ship season, it is anticipated that the District will have one instance of three cruise ships calling to San Diego simultaneously. If a third vessel needs to call concurrently, the CARB At-Berth Regulation allows for exceptions to be implemented, including the following: a CARB Approved Emissions Control Strategy (CAECS), a Terminal Incident Event (TIE), a Vessel Incident Event (VIE), or contributions to the CARB Remediation Fund. In 2022, it was estimated that B Street CST receives approximately 90-100 vessel calls annually; whereas Broadway CST receives approximately 12-14 vessel calls annually. On average, all vessels required to comply with CARB At-Berth Regulations at B Street CST represent an estimated 90% or more of total vessel calls. The remaining 10% of vessel calls estimated at B Street CST utilize CARB At-Berth Regulation exemptions, which are mostly TIEs or VIEs.

The Broadway Pier CST is considered a low activity terminal, which is a designation pursuant to the At-Berth Regulation. Terminals that receive fewer than 20 vessel visits per calendar year in 2021 and 2022 are considered "low activity terminals". If a low activity terminal sees an increase in vessel calls and has two consecutive years with 20 or more visits, they will become a regulated terminal for the purposes of the At-Berth Regulation and must comply with all control and planning requirements. Due to Broadway Pier CST's designation as a low activity terminal, vessels without shore power infrastructure can dock at the northern berth as long as the District retains the designation. The previous Project allowed for shore power infrastructure to be installed at Broadway Pier CST, allowing shore power capable vessels to connect, when possible. Therefore, the shore power infrastructure installed as part of the previous Project and the additional shore power connection on the southern berth of B Street CST to be installed as part of the proposed Project would enable all shore power capable cruise ships calling to San Diego to be plugged to shore power, while continuing to comply with the CARB At-Berth Regulation. The proposed Project would not increase the capacity of vessel visits to B Street and Broadway Pier CST than what was analyzed from the previous Project, and the District would continue to comply with the CARB At-Berth Regulation, as revised.

In 2013, the District developed a Climate Action Plan (CAP) to reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions on District tidelands and proactively prepare for potential impacts associated with climate change. The CAP is a science-based, long-term planning document that includes an overview of baseline GHG emissions for all existing uses and operations on tidelands, GHG reduction goals for 2020, and GHG reduction policies and measures to achieve those goals over time. The District developed the CAP as a result of the California Global Warming Solutions Act of 2006, which set a statewide goal to reduce GHG emissions to 1990 levels by 2020, and Executive Order S-3-05, which extended statewide GHG emission reduction goals to 80% below 1990 levels by 2050. The GHG reduction goals for 2020 are no longer valid, because the proposed Project is being considered in 2024. However, the GHG reduction policies and measures established by the CAP are still applicable to all District projects. The proposed Project would be consistent with the GHG reduction policies and measures in the CAP, including the shore power candidate control measure, as the additional shore power connection point at B Street CST's southern berth would further reduce GHG and encourage alternative means for vessels to connect to shore power while at berth in San Diego. Additionally, the proposed Project would be consistent with measure TA5 from Table F-1 of the Reduction Measures Summary Table for Implementation, because the proposed Project would develop and encourage the use of shore power for ocean going vessels. The proposed Project would implement GHG reduction policies and measures identified in the CAP. The CAP could not have been known with the exercise of reasonable due diligence at the time the 2010 MND was adopted; and, the proposed Project would not create a conflict with the adopted CAP and would not result in a significant physical impact due to a conflict.

Additionally, the District developed the Maritime Clean Air Strategy (MCAS), which is a strategic planning document, adopted by the Board of Port Commissioners (Board) on October 12, 2021, that identifies short-term and long-term goals and objectives intended to facilitate achievement of a clean, sustainable, and modern seaport. The proposed Project would implement policies and goals identified in the MCAS. For example, the proposed Project implements Oceangoing Vessel Objective 2A of the Port's Maritime Clean Air Strategy (MCAS), improving air quality by significantly reducing Diesel Particulate Matter emission from ships-at-berth. Therefore, the proposed Project would not result in a conflict with the MCAS and would not result in a significant physical impact due to a conflict.

Following adoption of the 2010 MND, The Portside Community's Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) was adopted by the San Diego Air Pollution Control District (SDAPCD) on July 16, 2021, and CARB on October 14, 2021. The CERP is a plan for action to reduce air pollutant emissions and community exposure to those emissions in the Portside Community. The District is an identified agency with a responsibility to contribute to the implementation of the CERP. The proposed Project area is not located within a Portside Community, and therefore, would not result in a conflict with the CERP nor result in a conflict that would result in a significant physical impact.

As a result of State Bill 743 which took effect July 1, 2020, transportation impacts of new projects must be analyzed using a metric known as vehicle miles traveled (VMT) instead of levels of service (LOS). VMT measures how much actual auto travel (additional miles driven) a proposed project would create on California roads. If the project adds excessive car travel onto our roads, the project may cause a significant transportation impact. The 2010 MND prepared for the previous Project used LOS to analyze potentially significant transportation and traffic impacts. There were no significant impacts or mitigation measures identified for the previous Project related to transportation and traffic. Despite the mandated



metric change from LOS to VMT, the proposed Project would not cause or contribute to a significant impact, because transportation and traffic would only be construction related and thus temporary in nature.

The updated State and District regulations outlined above were not known and could not have been known with the exercise of reasonable due diligence at the time the 2010 MND was adopted. However, based on the discussions above, this new information did not result in a) one or more significant effects not discussed in the previous MND; b) more severe significant effects than what was previously analyzed in the MND; c) newly identified mitigation measures that would be more feasible for the proposed Project; or, d) mitigation measures which are considerably different from those analyzed in the previous MND.

Section 15164(a) of the State CEQA Guidelines states that "the lead agency or responsible agency shall prepare an addendum to a previously certified EIR if some changes or additions are necessary but none of the conditions described in Section 15162 calling for preparation of a subsequent EIR have occurred." Furthermore, State CEQA Guidelines Section 15164(b) states that "an addendum to an adopted negative declaration may be prepared if only minor technical changes or additions are necessary or none of the conditions described in Section 15162 calling for the preparation of a subsequent EIR or negative declaration have occurred." Based on the provisions of State CEQA Guidelines Sections 15162 and 15164, the Port District finds that none of the conditions described in Section 15162 call for preparation of a subsequent mitigated negative declaration have occurred and that an addendum to the B Street Shore Power Project shall be prepared for the proposed Project. In accordance with Section 15164(c), the Addendum is not required to be circulated for public review. The Board "shall consider the addendum with the ... adopted negative declaration prior to making a decision on the project", pursuant to State CEQA Guidelines Section 15164(d). The addendum is anticipated to be considered by the Board at its September 10, 2024 meeting.

### **INTENDED USES OF MND AND ADDENDUM**

The MND and the Addendum will be considered by the Board with respect to the following discretionary actions related to the project:

- Approval of issuance of Amendment No. 1 to Coastal Development Permit No. 2010-001 for the B Street Shore Power Project.
- Approval of plans and specifications and award contract for the construction of Additional South Berth Shore Power Connection Point at B Street Cruise Ship Terminal Project.